

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY REGION 5 77 WEST JACKSON BOULEVARD CHICAGO, IL 60604-3590

FEB 0 3 2017

REPLY TO THE ATTENTION OF

LC-8J

VIA EMAIL

Mr. Scott Doran Attorney for The Bellepoint Company, LLC. 3600 Olentangy River Road, Bldg. 501 Columbus, Ohio 43214-3437 sdoran@keglerbrown.com

> RE: Consent Agreement and Final Order In the Matter of: The Bellepoint Company, LLC Docket No. TSCA-05-2017-0002

Dear Mr. Doran:

Enclosed please find a copy of a fully executed Consent Agreement and Final Order (CAFO) in resolution of the above case. This document was filed on <u>Jebruary 3, 2017</u> with the Regional Hearing Clerk. The civil penalty in the amount of \$12,500, plus interest, is to be paid in the manner described in paragraphs 41 and 42. Please be certain that the docket number is written on each of the transmittal letters and on the checks.

Thank you for your cooperation in resolving this matter.

Sincerely,

mela Grace

Pamela Grace Pesticides and Toxic Compliance Section Land and Chemicals Division

UNITED STA	ATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY REGION 5
In the Matter of:	STAL HEARING Docket No. TSCA-05-2017-0002
The Bellepoint Company Columbus, Ohio	EXAMPLE 7 FEB - 3 201) Proceeding to Assess a Civil Penalty
	U.S. ENVIRONMENIAL PROTECTION AGENCY Control Act, 15 U.S.C. § 2615(a)
Respondent	REGION 5

Consent Agreement and Final Order

Preliminary Statement

1. This is an administrative action commenced and concluded under Section 16(a) of the Toxic Substances Control Act (TSCA), 15 U.S.C. § 2615(a), and the Consolidated Rules of Practice Governing the Administrative Assessment of Civil Penalties and the Revocation/ Termination or Suspension of Permits (Consolidated Rules), as codified at 40 C.F.R. Part 22.

2. The Complainant is, by lawful delegation, the Director of the Land and Chemicals Division, U. S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 5.

3. Respondent is The Bellepoint Company, LLC, located at 3600 Olentangy River Rd, Bldg 501, Columbus OH 43214-3437

4. Where the parties agree to settle one or more causes of action before the filing of a complaint, the administrative action may be commenced and concluded simultaneously by the issuance of a consent agreement and final order (CAFO). 40 C.F.R. § 22.13(b).

5. The parties agree that settling this action without the filing of a complaint or the adjudication of any issue of fact or law is in their interest and in the public interest.

6. Respondent consents to the assessment of the civil penalty specified in this CAFO and to the terms of this CAFO.

Jurisdiction and Waiver of Right to Hearing

7. Respondent admits the jurisdictional allegations in this CAFO and neither admits nor denies the general allegations in this CAFO.

8. Respondent waives its right to request a hearing as provided at 40 C.F.R. § 22.15(c), any right to contest the allegations in this CAFO and its right to appeal this CAFO.

Statutory and Regulatory Background

9. In promulgating the Residential Lead-Based Paint Hazard Reduction Act of 1992, at 42 U.S.C. § 4851 *et seq.*, Congress found, among other things, that low-level lead poisoning is widespread among American children, afflicting as many as 3,000,000 children under the age of 6; at low levels, lead poisoning in children causes intelligence deficiencies, reading and learning disabilities, impaired hearing, reduced attention span, hyperactivity, and behavior problems; and the ingestion of household dust containing lead from deteriorating or abraded lead-based paint is the most common cause of lead poisoning in children. A key component of the national strategy to reduce and eliminate the threat of childhood lead poisoning is to educate the public concerning the hazards and sources of lead-based paint poisoning and steps to reduce and eliminate such hazards.

10. Section 1021 of the Residential Lead-Based Paint Hazard Reduction Act of 1992 amended TSCA by adding Subchapter IV – Lead Exposure Reduction. Section 406(b) of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2686, required the Administrator of EPA to promulgate regulations to require each person who performs for compensation a renovation of target housing to provide a lead hazard information pamphlet to the owner and occupant of such housing prior to commencing the renovation.

11. Section 407 of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2687, required that the regulations promulgated by the Administrator include such recordkeeping and reporting requirements as may be necessary to insure the effective implementation of TSCA Subchapter IV.

12. On June 1, 1998, EPA promulgated, pursuant to 15 U.S.C. §§ 2686 and 2687, regulations codified at 40 C.F.R. Part 745, Subpart E, which were subsequently amended on April 22, 2008.

13. 40 C.F.R. § 745.83 defines *firm* to mean a company, partnership, corporation, sole proprietorship, or individual doing business, association, or other business entity; a Federal, State, Tribal, or local government agency; or a nonprofit organization.

14. 40 C.F.R. § 745.83 defines *renovation* to mean the modification of any existing structure, or portion thereof, that results in the disturbance of painted surfaces, unless that activity is performed as part of an abatement as defined by this part (40 C.F.R. § 745.223). The term renovation includes (but is not limited to): the removal, modification or repair of painted surfaces or painted components (e.g., modification of painted doors, surface restoration, window repair, surface preparation activity (such as sanding, scraping, or other such activities that may generate paint dust)); the removal of building components (e.g., walls, ceilings, plumbing, windows); weatherization projects (e.g., cutting holes in painted surfaces to install blown-in insulation or to gain access to attics, planning thresholds to install weather stripping), and interim controls that disturb painted surfaces.

15. 40 C.F.R. § 745.103 defines *residential dwelling* to mean a single family dwelling, including attached structures such as porches and stoops; or a single-family dwelling unit in a structure that contains more than one separate residential dwelling unit, and in which each such

unit is used or occupied, or intended to be used or occupied, in whole or in part, as the residence of one or more persons.

16. 40 C.F.R. § 745.103 defines *target housing* to mean any housing constructed prior to 1978, except housing for the elderly or persons with disabilities (unless any child who is less than six (6) years of age resides or is expected to reside in such housing) or any zero-bedroom dwelling.

17. 40 C.F.R. § 745.81(a)(2)(ii) requires that on or after April 22, 2010, no firm may perform, offer, or claim to perform renovations in target housing or child occupied facilities without certification from EPA under 40 C.F.R. § 745.89 unless the renovation qualifies for one of the exceptions identified in 40 C.F.R. § 745.82(a) or (c).

18. 40 C.F.R. § 745.84(a) requires that each person who performs for compensation a renovation in a residential dwelling unit of target housing must provide a lead hazard information pamphlet (Pamphlet) to the owner and occupant of such housing prior to commencing the renovation.

19. Under Section 409 of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2689, it is unlawful for any person to fail or refuse to comply with Sections 406 and 407 of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. §§ 2686, 2687, or any rule or order issued thereunder.

20. Section 16(a) of TSCA, 42 U.S.C. § 2615, and 40 C.F.R. § 745.87(d) authorize the EPA Administrator to assess a civil penalty of up to \$25,000 for each violation of Section 409 of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2689. Each day that such a violation continues constitutes a separate violation of Section 409 of TSCA. The Debt Collection Improvement Act of 1996, 31 U.S.C. § 3701, and its implementing regulations at 40 C.F.R. Part 19, increased these statutory maximum penalties to \$37,500 for violations that occurred after January 12, 2009.

General Allegations

21. During calendar years 2014 and 2015, Respondent was a limited liability company organized under the laws of Ohio.

22. During 2014 and 2015, Respondent was a firm as defined by 40 C.F.R. § 745.83.

23. During 2014 and 2015, Respondent, for compensation, performed, or directed workers who performed, modifications of existing structures that resulted in disturbances of painted surfaces as detailed in this paragraph.

Property Address	Year Built	Renovation Activities	Date of Contract
227 East Sycamore Street	1900	Interior and Exterior Renovation	January 5, 2015
Columbus, Ohio			
1884 Gullford Road	1954	Interior Renovation and Addition	November 17, 2015
Upper Arlington, Ohio			
617 Hartford Street	1908	Interior and Exterior Renovation	March 23, 2015
Worthington, Ohio			
2020 Andover Road	1940	Interior and Exterior Renovation	October 14, 2014
Columbus, Ohio			
3800 Overdale Drive	1960	Kitchen Remodel	January 27, 2015
Upper Arlington, Ohio			

24. The properties listed in paragraph 23 were residential dwellings as defined by 40 C.F.R. § 745.103.

25. The residential dwellings listed in paragraph 23 were built prior to 1978.

26. The residential dwellings listed in paragraph 23 were target housing as defined at

40 C.F.R. § 745.103.

27. In performing the work identified in paragraph 23, Respondent disturbed and removed interior and exterior painted surfaces and components.

28. The work identified in paragraph 23 were renovations as defined at 40 C.F.R. § 745.83.

Counts 1 through 10

29. <u>Count 1</u>: Respondent performed, offered, or claimed to perform a renovation at 227 East Sycamore Street, Columbus, Ohio, but failed to first obtain from EPA the certification required by 40 C.F.R. § 745.89, in violation of 40 C.F.R. § 745.81(a)(2)(ii).

30. <u>Count 2</u>: Respondent performed, offered, or claimed to perform a renovation at 1884 Gullford Road, Columbus, Ohio, but failed to first obtain from EPA the certification required by 40 C.F.R. § 745.89, in violation of 40 C.F.R. § 745.81(a)(2)(ii).

31. <u>Count 3</u>: Respondent performed, offered, or claimed to perform a renovation at 617 Hartford Street, Worthington, Ohio, but failed to first obtain from EPA the certification required by 40 C.F.R. § 745.89, in violation of 40 C.F.R. § 745.81(a)(2)(ii).

32. <u>Count 4</u>: Respondent performed, offered, or claimed to perform a renovation at 2020 Andover Road, Columbus, Ohio, but failed to first obtain from EPA the certification required by 40 C.F.R. § 745.89, in violation of 40 C.F.R. § 745.81(a)(2)(ii).

33. <u>Count 5</u>: Respondent performed, offered, or claimed to perform a renovation at 3800 Overdale Drive, Upper Arlington, Ohio, but failed to first obtain from EPA the certification required by 40 C.F.R. § 745.89, in violation of 40 C.F.R. § 745.81(a)(2)(ii).

34. <u>**Count 6**</u>: Respondent failed to provide the owner of the residential property at 227 East Sycamore Street, Columbus, Ohio, with a Pamphlet prior to the renovation described in paragraph 23 at that address, in violation of 40 C.F.R. § 745.84.

35. <u>Count 7</u>: Respondent failed to provide the owner of the residential property at 1884 Gullford Road, Upper Arlington, Ohio, with a Pamphlet prior to the renovation described in paragraph 23 at that address, in violation of 40 C.F.R. § 745.84.

36. <u>**Count 8**</u>: Respondent failed to provide the owner of the residential property at 617 Hartford Street, Worthington, Ohio, with a Pamphlet prior to the renovation described in paragraph 23 at that address, in violation of 40 C.F.R. § 745.84.

37. <u>Count 9</u>: Respondent failed to provide the owner of the residential property at 2020
Andover Road, Columbus, Ohio, with a Pamphlet prior to the renovation described in paragraph
23 at that address, in violation of 40 C.F.R. § 745.84.

38. <u>Count 10</u>: Respondent failed to provide the owner of the residential property at 3800 Overdale Drive, Upper Arlington, Ohio, with a Pamphlet prior to the renovation described in paragraph 23 at that address, in violation of 40 C.F.R. § 745.84.

39. Respondent's failures described in paragraphs 29-38 constitute ten violations of 40 C.F.R. Part 745 and 15 U.S.C. § 2689.

Civil Penalty

40. Pursuant to Section 16(a) of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2615(a), Complainant determined that an appropriate civil penalty to settle this action was \$12,500. In determining the penalty amount, Complainant considered the nature, circumstances, extent and gravity of the violation or violations alleged and, with respect to the violator, ability to pay, effect on ability to continue to do business, any history of prior such violations, the degree of culpability, and such other factors as justice may require. Complainant also considered EPA's Interim Final Consolidated Enforcement Response and Penalty Policy for the Pre-Renovation Education Rule; Renovation, Repair and Painting Rule; and Lead-Based Paint Activities Rule, dated August 19, 2010.

41. Respondent must pay a \$12,500 civil penalty with interest in four installments as follows: \$3,156.25 within 90 days of the effective date of this CAFO; \$3148.44 with 180 days of the effective date of this CAFO; \$3,140.63 within 270 days of the effective date of this

CAFO; and \$3,132.81 within 360 days of the effective date of this CAFO. Respondent must pay the installments by sending a cashier's or certified check, payable to "Treasurer, United States of America," to:

U.S. EPA Fines and Penalties Cincinnati Finance Center P.O. Box 979077 St. Louis, Missouri 63197-9000

Each check must state "In the Matter of The Bellepoint Company, LLC" and the Docket Number of this CAFO.

42. A transmittal letter stating Respondent's Name, Address, Case Title, Case Docket

Number and the Billing Document Number must accompany each payment. Respondent must

send a copy of each check and transmittal letter to:

Regional Hearing Clerk (E-19J) U.S. EPA, Region 5 77 West Jackson Boulevard Chicago, Illinois 60604

Pamela Grace (LC-8J) Pesticides and Toxics Compliance Section U.S. EPA, Region 5 77 West Jackson Boulevard Chicago, Illinois 60604

Charles Mikalian (C-14J) Office of Regional Counsel U.S. EPA, Region 5 77 West Jackson Boulevard Chicago, Illinois 60604

43. This civil penalty is not deductible for federal tax purposes.

44. If Respondent does not pay timely any installment payment as set forth in paragraph

41, the entire unpaid balance of the civil penalty shall become due and owing upon written notice

by EPA to Respondent of the delinquency. EPA may refer this matter to the Attorney General who will recover such amount, plus interest, in the appropriate district court of the United States under Section 16(a) of TSCA, 15 U.S.C. § 2615(a). The validity, amount, and appropriateness of the civil penalty are not reviewable in a collection action.

45. Pursuant to 31 C.F.R. § 901.9, Respondent must pay the following on any amount overdue under this CAFO. Interest will accrue on any amount overdue from the date the payment was due at a rate established pursuant to 31 U.S.C. § 3717. Respondent must pay a \$15 handling charge each month that any portion of the penalty is more than 30 days past due. In addition, Respondent must pay a 6 percent per year penalty on any principal amount 90 days past due.

General Provisions

46. Consistent with the "Standing Order Authorizing E-Mail Service of Order and Other Documents Issued by the Regional Administrator or Regional Judicial Officer Under the Consolidated Rules," dated March 27, 2015, the parties consent to service of this CAFO by email at the following valid e-mail addresses: <u>mikalian.charles@epa.gov</u> (for Complainant), and <u>sdoran@keglerbrown.com</u> (for Respondent). The parties waive their right to service by the methods specified in 40 C.F.R. § 22.6.

47. This CAFO resolves only Respondent's liability for federal civil penalties for the violations alleged in the CAFO.

48. This CAFO does not affect the rights of EPA or the United States to pursue appropriate injunctive or other equitable relief or criminal sanctions for any violations of law.

49. This CAFO does not affect Respondent's responsibility to comply with TSCA, regulations promulgated thereunder, and other applicable federal, state, and local laws.

50. Respondent certifies that it is complying with TSCA and regulations promulgated thereunder.

51. The terms of this CAFO bind Respondent, and its successors and assigns.

52. Each person signing this agreement certifies that he or she has the authority to sign for the party whom he or she represents and to bind that party to its terms.

53. Each party agrees to bear its own costs and attorney's fees in this action.

54. This CAFO constitutes the entire agreement between the parties.

In the Matter of: The Bellepoint Company, LLC Docket No. TSCA-05-2017-0002

The Bellepoint Company, LLC, Respondent

12/13/16 Date

Samuel Teitt, President

The Bellepoint Company, LLC

ĸ

United States Environmental Protection Agency, Complainant

1/26/2017

Date

Malgaret M. Guerriero Director Land and Chemicals Division

In the Matter of: The Bellepoint Company, LLC Docket No. TSCA-05-2017-0002

~

Final Order

This Consent Agreement and Final Order, as agreed to by the parties, shall become effective immediately upon filing with the Regional Hearing Clerk. This Final Order concludes this proceeding pursuant to 40 C.F.R. §§ 22.18 and 22.31. IT IS SO ORDERED.

<u>Fubriary</u>, 2017 Date

an Lol Ann Coyle

Regional Judicial Officer United States Environmental Protection Agency Region 5

In the Matter of: Docket Number:

The Bellepoint Company, LLC TSCA-05-2017-0002

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that I served a true and correct copy of the forgoing Consent Agreement and Final Order, which was filed on $\frac{32017}{32017}$, in the following manner to the addressees:

Copy by e-mail to Attorney for Respondent:

Scott Doran sdoran@keglerbrown.com

Copy by e-mail to Attorney for Complainant:

Charles Mikalian Mikalian.Charles@epa.gov

Copy by e-mail to Regional Judicial Officer:

Ann Coyle Coyle.Ann@epa.gov

February B, 2017 Dated

LaDawn Whitehead Regional Hearing Clerk U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 5